

# Investigating Gender Justice to the Minorities: The case of Pretty Transpuan in Denpasar, Bali

Nazrina Zuryani

Department of Sociology

FISIP Udayana University Denpasar, Indonesia

nazrinazuryani@unud.ac.id

## Abstract

The topic is a discrimination related to e-KTP/*Kartu Tanda Penduduk* electronic in transpuan/transwoman circles. The Balinese used to be tolerant toward sexual marginality. A narrow re-interpretation of tradition and scriptures sometimes brings about new attitudes of repression. The government, instead of protecting transwomen as it does in advanced countries, does little. Many transpuans/transwomen originate from outside Bali and the civil registration office includes them among the “*kaum rentan*” fragile or marginal groups; transpuan, the *gepeng/gelandangan* (bums) and the mentally-ill people. Many make do without identity card (e-KTP), creating social discrimination and disruption in personal life. This article focusses on a group called the Pretty Transpuan/Warcan located in Ubung, north of Denpasar. The data shows that they are subjected to all sorts of coercion and violence. This coercion often consists of illegal fees (KIPEM as *Kartu Indentitas Penduduk Musiman* as migrants permit) they are requested to pay. Protection is thus an issue; some hire *preman* (thugs) to protect them, even though it is now rarer due to the pandemic. However, institutional steps do exist: the Disdukcapil/civil registration regency offices is registering all citizens, including the “*kaum rentan*”, but does not always do it properly. Exit politics (Connell, 1995; 220) which is episodic suggests skilful actors helping transpuans to gain e-KTP registration.

## Keywords

Transgender, Transpuan, Gender Justice, Minorities, and Kelompok Rentan.

## 1. Introduction

Transgender is a little-known phenomenon, which is also found in Balinese society. This society used to be tolerant toward sexual marginality. Some of the Balinese dances show so called “gender fluidity” where the men become women in dance groups or solo performances or vice versa. This kind of fluidity is found for instance in “Calonarang” dance or in the “Gambuh” classical performance where the male role of Panji is usually played by a woman. Geertz discusses this fluidity in his book *Negara, the Theater State* (1980), where he mentions the existence of transgender people. Until today transgender performers are found in the *Gandrung* and also *Arja Muani* dance in which a male dancer sings in female way. However, nowadays a narrow re-interpretation of tradition and scriptures sometimes brings about attitudes of repression. When a Balinese family is faced with the reality of one of their members displaying gender fluidity, this tradition of tolerance is increasingly being openly denied. Is this change caused by the Islamic ethics prevalent in Indonesia? Probably.

In another South-East Asian society such as Thailand, transgender is a fully acknowledged and widely accepted gender-friendly social phenomenon. Thai parents often authorize hormonal treatments to turn their son into a woman or vice versa, even though the latter case is less common. In the past, “discrimination was absent”, but now, when the Balinese accept sexual marginality, it is with more and more reservation as discovered by Zuryani and Erviantono (2021: 235) in North Bali where Wargas members like to be called *transpuans* a social signal to be accepted and gain acceptance as it has positive meaning (Trans; *puan* is the lady). This article also addresses the transwoman as a transpuan. This Wargas association in North Bali is also available to gain recognition from the surrounding community since the 1990s. In any case sexual transactions among them that they call it as “nyebong” is still taking place. However, most of the trans-ladies in Wargas work and is actively participating in social events, including fund raising and distributing 9 basic foods during Covid pandemic in 2020 to this present time. The case of Wargas as an association in the north of Bali is particularly interesting. Its head, Mami SC, once explained how she manages to get performing jobs or other jobs (such as teaching English for kids who is doing on line schooling during

Covid pandemic) are within the framework of her gender difference. She is also famous as a dogs and cats rescuer with her house as a shelter. But this was made possible only because she became a public figure. She got protection from otherwise much feared community security organizations (*Organisasi Masyarakat/Ormas*) such as *Baladika*, *Laskar Bali* and *Buldog/Buleleng Dogen* that widely known in Bali as famously as FPI/*Front Pembela Islam* in Jakarta.

Open discrimination is mild in Northern Bali, several organizations do not hesitate showing support toward the LGBTIQ (Lesbians, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and also Intersex and Queer) people. The Gaya Dewata Foundation is providing services, related or not to PMS/sexually transmitted diseases, exclusively to LGBT people. Other NGO organizations look after LGBT issues mildly, such as Yakeba (Yayasan Kesehatan Bali), Yayasan Kerti Praja, Yayasan Sehati, but these NGOs deal with health issues of the wider community at large. Only Gaya Dewata focuses specifically on LGBT issues and possibly Suara Kita in Jakarta. Table 1 shows the available Organizations for LGBTIQ among 68 important LGBTQ organizations worldwide. According to UNDP report (based on dialog of LGBT Indonesia in June 2013), at least two big LGBT organizations and 49 organizations were available at nation-wide scale with its representative by provinces in Indonesia. Table below is a compilation of organizations based on locations and its goals exist in Bali.

Table 1. Several Organisations for Health and Empowerment of LGBT in Bali

<b>Name of Organisations</b>	<b>Locations</b>	<b>Goals of Organisations</b>
Yayasan Gaya Dewata	Denpasar	Advocating the rights of LGBT Bali based on each community available
Pelangi Muda Dewata	Denpasar, Badung and Singaraja	Helping youth of LGBT to empower themselves
Yayasan Kasih Pelangi Dewata/KAPELATA	Denpasar	Increasing personal capacity of LGBT
Yayasan Kesehatan Bali/Yakeba	Denpasar	Despite Drug Users helper, this organization help LGBT to gain better health via training and skill motivations
Yayasan Kerti Praja	Denpasar	Helping people with HIV/AIDS including LGBT to survive and get health access
Wargas (Transpuan organization)	Singaraja	Utilize as much as human resources available in this organization to increase acceptance and quality life of Transgender, especially the transwomen

**Source:** Personal Compilation of Zuryani, 2022.

In the south of the island, in the city of Denpasar and the regency of Badung, the situation is different. Most transpuans or transwomen work in the informal sectors. The locations where they operate -Kuta, Seminyak, Legian, Jimbaran and Nusa Dua- are touristic areas whereas they could easily find income before the Corona pandemic. There are at least two groups of transpuan in Denpasar itself. One is Warcan, acronym for *Waria Cantik* or PrettyTranspuan, which is located in Ubung in the North of Denpasar next to Badung regency and is the focus of the present article. Another one is Perwaron (*Persatuan Waria Renon*), located in the Renon area, an elite area at the center of government offices in the heart of Denpasar.

In any case though, discrimination is still pervading. Some transpuans, such as the Wargas in Singaraja mentioned above, may have been regular performers of Singaraja festivals since the 1990s, but such an acceptance is never guaranteed. A personal visit made in 2019 to the powerful head of the Sanur's Brahmins, which aimed at having the Warcan/Pretty Transpuan perform at the upcoming Sanur Village Festival, did not get the expected green light, under the pretext that the festival would not make fun of transgender people. So, community leader remains allergic to transpuans. As Zuryani with her team of community intervention in 2019 has made the course of "tengkuluk lelunakan" a kind of hair piece in a traditional mascot traditional dress for women in Denpasar for transpuans with

HIV/AIDS to make them and other transpuan being accepted in any festivals in Denpasar.

This intervention seemingly failed as the head of Provincial Culture (*Kadis Kebudayaan Bali*) reluctant to invite these transpuans with tengkuluk lelunakan in Pekan Kesenian Bali/Bali Art Weeks nor in Bali Jani Festival in Denpasar as written by Zuryani et al (2021: 89). This issue is not limited to Bali. In early 2021, I undertook an independent study of transpuan groups in Yogyakarta and be friended several of their members, including the heads of the groups. There too, many transpuans make a living without any legal and up dated electronic identity card (e-KTP) or other civil registration document suggested. All these factors bear on the social well-being and personal life of the transgender people. They are not only marginalized but the supra structure and people in power neglecting them on purpose. This might be due to asking performance that showing of their transenderism and making them exist in social and art milieu that are painstakingly still heteronormative and gender blind. Both people in power related to tradition and art performance were making an excuse that the body of transgender is not for humiliation which is not the goal for this community intervention.

As a matter a fact, the Disdukcapil (*Dinas Kependudukan dan Catatan Sipil*) in each province down to each regency in Indonesia is responsible for any civil registration, from the birth certificate, marriage and death certificates that covering data for individual member in a household. Nowadays, as the information technology is reaching its four generation and moving to five generation, the Disdukcapil is renewing its service besides e-KTP with the platform of “*Peduli Lindungi*”. Every adult gets an e-KTP in the age of 17<sup>th</sup> years old. In this e-KTP, every citizen in Indonesia belongs to a NIK (*Nomor Induk Kependudukan*) that is stated in their Kartu Keluarga/KK. This NIK is a wizard for each person to understand how the civil registration works in a family of Indonesian as they have each individual NIK number as well. Then when they hold a mobile phone, they have to register to the new platform whereas they could have better health and safety services during Covid-19 pandemic. This “*Peduli Lindungi*” is one application for all. The meaning of this platform is deeply rooted in Bahasa Indonesia as *Peduli* means Care, while *Lindungi* means protect, equal to platform of “Care and Protect”. Here, the issue of e-KTP is becoming minor as long as the legal system that register by an individual is properly done in this real time application. The KTP as a card physically appears as an old (plastic laminating) and new one as electronic card that is issued by every Disdukcapil in every district and city in Indonesia.

It is by national regulation that the government at district level change all inhabitant’s old version of identity cards who are above 17 years old with the new electronic KTP. This e-KTP is a proper card that is related to the QR Code of the head of household gets and then given to every e-KTP card holder members of household in Indonesia.

## **1.1 Objectives**

This article aims at investigating civil registration for transgender people, especially the transpuans. Investigation objective is to enhance social justice through the concrete issue of e-KTP. But how to do it when the concept of gender justice is not yet thinkable for the apparatus civil registration officers and when the government does not have any inclusive treatment policy addressed to them. In 2019, a community intervention was taking place to include the Denpasar dan Buleleng transpuans (including those with HIV/Aids) to perform in festivals wearing “tengkuluk lelunakan” (Zuryani et al, 2021), they are not accepted by the local persona as the sign of discrimination. Social justice thus paramount in the case of human rights as illustrated in the hurdles experienced by transpuans into getting their e-KTP from the civil registration office or Disdukcapil.

## **2. Literature Review**

Benedict Anderson witnessed in the early 1960s the ‘*banci*’ or half man and half women that hung about the Menteng area in Jakarta. Usually called *bencong*, he noticed the discrimination they were subjected to. Then as a young researcher, he noticed that his female friends associated them to participants of beauty peagants; it was a compliment, those *bencong* were so stunning at night. In the prologue he wrote for the book “*Memberi Suara Pada yang Bisu*”, he explains how *bencong* would freely hang about Jakarta all night long. Most of them were really beautiful, but the police would now and then set up razzia and jail them for a while for selling their bodies. A Kompas article dated from August 18th 1968 (from Historia 2015) explains that there was at the time no less than 15.000 *bencong* in Jakarta. They were divided into four types. The first ones were said to be “eternal” *bencong abadi*, meaning that they behaved like women. The second were said to be half *setengah bencong*, meaning that they could be bisexual, performing as men “in the morning” and as female at night. The third were called *bencong bantet* or “over-cooked” meaning that they usually perform as transpuan but on other occasions suddenly return to their male identity in public; they are thus

a type of bi-sexual as well. The last one was the hidden *bencong sembunyi* or those *waria (wanita pria)* who hid their identity and performed as men.

In Australia, Raewyn Connell, a transgender woman could become a parliament member and university professor. She is also a prolific writer about gender issues, who published at least seven books alone on the topic. In “Gender and Power” (1987), she proclaims what she calls the “politics of personality”, meaning the possibility to degender oneself. A similar degendering phenomenon was witnessed by Zuryani and Erviantono (2021) in Bali in the case of the Wargas’ head figure in Northern Bali who went through a ritual process so called “multicultural tolerance”. Unlike Connell, Judith Butler, in “Gender Trouble” (1990), claims that feminist theory cannot be called upon to solve the issues related to gender fluidity. Butler’s point of view is well-known in queer studies. According to Butler, gender performativity is determined by culturally dominant heterosexual patterns of identity. Connell (1995) on the other hand, in her seminal book of “Masculinities”, proposes the concept of hegemonic masculinity. She then goes about explaining “the science of masculinity” and its dynamics. Then she moves to politics, claiming that after the gay liberation movement, the transwomen have no other choice than going into exit politics, meaning endlessly “exiting”, with no solution other than provisional and “episodic”, from the world of hegemonic and complicit masculinity, into “the moment of contestation” (1995: 139).

Beyond exit politics by Connell, this article draws upon the political constructivism of Charles Tilly (2004, Tilly 2005, Tilly 2006), Colin Hay (Hay 2008, Hay 2016), and Laurence Whitehead (2003) in which performativity is also central to repertoires of contentious politics in which challengers act collectively against the established institutions of an ancient regime in their effort to constitute new institutions or perhaps radically reform old ones. Collective action can succeed if it avoids both the avant gardeism of arcane arguments that interest only aficionados (fans to them) and the boring repetition of tired old routines (the press conference, the parliamentary speech, the campaign launch) that attract no mass of followers either, and instead it invents new tactics that wrongfoot their opponents and excite their followers. Here, Tilly proposes three metaphors about the prospects of democratization (Tilly 1995), which we can redeploy to think about transgenderism as a movement for exit politics. If LGBT human rights are thought to be a garden, then sufficiently skillful gardeners can plant and maintain one anywhere, anytime – in airport transit lounge, on skyscraper roof, and so forth. If LGBT human rights are thought to be an oilfield, then miners can only strike oil if the ancient, geological preconditions are right. If those preconditions are missing, then tough luck no matter how skillful you might be or when you might be hoping to achieve your aims. If LGBT human rights are thought to be a lake, then skillful engineers can build one in a valley with a river and plenty of space for the lake behind a dam, but not in a vast, flat desert but there are also times and places when a lake forms naturally, in say a dormant volcano or large dip in the landscape. As a lake, the politics of exiting an oppressive gender order in favour of achieving LGBT human rights and multicultural genderism are matters of history and politics, contingent upon both the right conditions and timely action by skillful actors.

The skillful actors are expected to be the main players in the lake of transgenderism in Indonesia that can create inclusive and yet justice toward the transpeople in Indonesia. In this article, those officers in Disdukcapil, in the public milieu and public facilities must become skillful actors and professionals to protect the right of transpeople to get their access equally. The transpeople are expected to participate in any occasions so as work in public sphere, there is no discrimination nor stigma should be appeared in the air. As long as the transpeople are behaving properly and do not commit any criminal events, then the heteronormativity can only be minor. They are actually the minority among heteronormative majority persons.

The way chosen by the Bali transpeople to break down their stigma, for example when they “provoke” by the male Disdukcapil officers as explained in the discussion section below, is very much part of exit politics such as defined by Connell. As Connell wrote: “Since exit politics relates to overall structure of gender order, it has no local base”. It means that either in Jakarta, in Bali or even in Thailand or Sydney; Australia, this exit politics is “likely to be episodic” and provisional and thus does not lead to any final way out (Connell, 1995; 224). In Bali especially in Pretty Transpeople group, the gender order is “episodic”: it goes from the transpeople who are hiding themselves from their families to the performers who make a living in the tourism industry, and now to the struggle of the LGBT to process their e-KTP. Their struggle is endless.

### **3. Methods**

The core of information collected for this article consists of personal in-depth interviews held in Denpasar city and Badung regency in Bali in 2020 and 2021, thus during the pandemic. These in-depth interviews took place in public,

often in open air areas. In 2021, the key informant were Ms. TRS and KRS, the head of Pretty Transpuan and Ms MRI. They were easily engaged in in-depth conversations. Ms. TRS became Zuryani's Facebook friend so as other social media platforms and since then these MedSos provides regular information that are usually recorded via mobile phone. Ms TRS with Ms Natasha in 2022 are still assisted those transpuan without e-KTP under "Suara Kita" networking.

However, several other sources were also used. For example, Zuryani collected informal information on previous other occasions: in 2019, when she conducted a community intervention that aimed at teaching transpuans from Denpasar and Singaraja how to make and wear the *tengkuluk lelunakan*, a traditional beauty head and dress. Zuryani held focus group discussions both in Denpasar and Singaraja. The result of 2019 community intervention was not promising toward gender justice of those transpuans that is showing lack of care in Bali. Zuryani also collected informal information during a visit to transpuans in Yogyakarta. The Table 2 shows the source of method used for this research.

Table 2. Methods Utilized on Investigating the Gender Injustice

No.	Method of Investigation	Partticipants	Year of Investigation
1.	Ms TRS and Ms NTS discovered 19 transpuans without e-KTP in Badung and Denpasar	2	2022
2.	Ms TRS and Mr HTY invited Ms Zuryani to attend FGD and meet Disdukcapil officers in Denpasar	14	2021
3.	In-depth interviews with Ms KRS, as the head of Pretty Transpuan organization	3	2021
4.	From an in-depth interview, Bunda SH as the head of Pesantren Waria in Yogyakarta promised that she must fighting to advocate gender injustice for all transpuans despite religious belief, race, ethnic groups (SARA) and get their e-KTP.	1	2020
5.	FGD with transpuans of Badung and Denpasar so as Singaraja. Ms IS experienced some abusive gestures by the pecalangs in Denpasar. FGD with Warga member in Singaraja to offer the practice of "tengkuluk lelunakan"/hair piece.	31	2019

**Source:** Personal Investigation of Zuryani, 2022.

The head of Pesantren Waria in Yogyakarta, bunda SH is willing to show her e-KTP in a picture taken by herself in order to make sure, she and her transpuan community are still fighting for this social justice. Transpuans in Yogyakarta as well is having similar problem to get their e-KTP but the actors behind the scene are more collaborative. They are more united in action.

#### 4. Data Collection

Data collection was undertaken by interviews, most of them recorded. However, some transpuans refused to be recorded but accepted to be photographed. With my key informants, my phone calls so as chats were recorded in my own smart phone. Ms TRS, from Surabaya, was one of such informants, Ms MRI, from Jember, a warung/kiosk owner, was another one. She, as well as Ms KRS, the head of Pretty Transpuan group, have always been cooperative. Five members of Pretty transpuan living together with Ms. KRS on the second floor of a *kost*-rooms for rent in the Ubung area made up another group of informants, always easy to engage in conversation. Many of these informants, including Ms, TRS, Ms. MRI, Ms KRS as well as three other members of Pretty Transpuan group only held an old laminated KTP Identity card till 2021 and Ms TRS proceed her e-KTP successfully at the end of 2021. She thanks the Dukcapil (her Facebook picture shown this gratitude openly) for this but keep fighting for her other fellow transpuans who have no proper ID as Indonesian. Ms TRS had in early 2022 an estimation of 19 transpuans still struggle to get back their KK as their primary source of data (stated as Nomor Induk Kependudukan/NIK) to have the new e-KTP. Another data was, a member of Pretty Transpuan reported experiencing money extortion before the pandemic (in 2019): the pecalang from south Ubung asked her to pay for her KIPEM (staying permit monthly or up to three month) an amount of Rp. 500.000 every two months or so. This coercion was exercised by pecalangs only in South Ubung, thus only in one particular banjar (similar to an Rukun Warga/RW in other parts of Bali). She was being regularly reminded that she had to pay in order to be safe. Here are several considerations during data collection of this research that is

still under way to get back their civil rights as Indonesian citizens as shown in the Table 3.

Table 3. Several Consideration from Informants in Data Collection

No.	Community Groups and Individu of Transpuan Live in Denpasar	Considerations
1.	Pretty transpuan members who still hold old KTP	Get back their family card/KK
2.	Those who paid an excessive amount of KIPEM (pecalang permits)	Move to the new accommodation
3.	Transpuans who are still have problem processing e-KTP (19 or so)	Trace back their lineage/family three and get their NIK in KK

**Source:** Data Collection of Zuryani, 2022.

All together in Denpasar, there are 19 transpuans without e-KTP. Such e-KTP are still being processed by the available Disdukcapil offices in Bali. This is also assisted by Ms TRS and other volunteers under surveillance of “Suara Kita” as Non-Governance Organisation (Mr. HTY) that help them since September 2021 till now.

## 5. Results and Discussion

It is clear that the centralized e-KTP Identity system has faced numerous problems since it was implemented by the President decree No. 26// 2009. It started with a huge corruption case. Instead of protecting its citizens as it does in advanced countries, the government does little. The situation in Bali is further complicated by the fact that many transpuans originate from outside the island. The civil registration office includes them among the “kaum rentan”, or fragile groups, which comprises the transpuan, the gepeng/gelandangan (bums) and the mentally-ill people. Their situation is not easy as there are so far no bums or mentally-ill people among them.

Three of our informants shows us their KTP (old laminated KTP in Bali and one e-KTP in Yogyakarta) and it is stated to be the name of men with the gender of a man. This also shows the civil registration in Indonesia which initially also put 6 religious beliefs only to be recognized then later on when e-KTP issuance they accept other traditional beliefs. The debate on this was so hot following the abbreviation of ex-communist party follower (with ET) in Orde Baru rezime then after “Transformasi Era” in the KTP was erased. Clearly, as religion in the KTP so as status of each holder did make scandalous civil registration, gender identity in Indonesia’s public administration is also gender blind. Gender blind means bullying when possible as the picture in e-KTP can be shown as a woman but their gender is a man. This should be under surveillance for any public service officers. In the airport for example, the check point was from the *Peduli Lindungi* application and also from the e-KTP. This check point is also common in other public areas and when an officer (be it security guard, custom officer and the like) sees the transpuan e-KTP that has women touch and make up, no one can judge them in the public by mocking them or discriminate them as long as their document is complete. This means that challengers act collectively against the established institutions of an *ancient regime* followers who judge people based on their looked. In Bali, one particular officer from Yakeba explained that when this LSM invited one speaker from Thailand in 2020, the custom in Ngurah Rai airport was so annoying and asked her to open up her skirt. She felt so insulted as a transwoman. As Bali should be more tolerant toward any gender multicultural as happened in the north, the case of the south is somehow different. Here, we pinpoint that *transpuan* is a generic name for transwoman who has the soul and appearance of a woman, while *bencong* can be a cat calling from heteronormative person toward a transwoman and the meaning is rude. The definition of *waria* here means an emblem glued in the transpuan appearance and existence.

Beyond the religious and often mystical tolerance of *waria* in north of Bali, there is also extensive prejudice, homophobia, and transphobia which are based in assumptions that transwomen transgress a natural binary order. This leads to many *waria* working in the informal sector. The *preman* (thugs) in Bali are part of a *de facto* social security system (Vandenberg & Zuryani 2020) operates. They work as debt collectors, bouncers, and body guards in every village alongside the *pecalang* (traditional village temple guards). Our interview with Miss TRS snowballed into a network around half a dozen LGBT bars along Jalan Kayu Aya in the beachside village of Seminyak. Miss TRS introduced us to Miss MRI as the owner of a food stall and the Emak (mother) of eight tranwomen in the area. Both Miss TRS and Miss MRI are well known in Seminyak’s tourism. Both of them during the 2020 and 2021’s interviewed were still hold the laminated old KTPs.

On the other part of north Denpasar, Ms. KRS was the head of Pretty Transpuan at the onset of the pandemic. At the end of 2019, she bought 3 sewing machine and got regular order of Rainbow bags from a couple of Kuta’s boutiques. These rainbow bags are made of parachute material and sell very easily. When the pandemic hit in 2020, there were

many orders for bags and additional ones for Rainbow pillows. Thus now, most Pretty Transpuan members still do have jobs. They keep getting order for bags and pillows. Yet, protection remains an issue as some still have to hire *preman* (thugs) to protect them, even though it has become rarer due to the pandemic. However, institutional steps do exist: the Disdukcapil/civil registration offices is now supposed to officially register all citizens, including the “kaum rentan”, but does not always implement it. The short coming was due to several bad experience faced by transpuans when taking up in public property.

One particular member of Pretty Transpuan experience for example, during the course of wearing “tengkuluk Lelunakan” an act of coercion toward her. Ms IS shows us the KIPEM documents at a price of Rp. 500,000 to be paid every 3 months and this becomes an obligation. Pretty Transpuan Coordinator, Ms. KRSM deeply regrets this discriminatory condition. As far as the discussion goes, Ms. IS can be the real target of this course and she should undergo health routine while at the same time the *pecalang* forced her to pay more in order to safe her stay in that village. Other immigrant workers pay as much as Rp. 300,000/quarter of year, less then Ms. IS KIPEM’s payment. It seems the *pecalang* as a traditional security guard for a *desa adat* knows to get the target of coercion and money scammer. The attitude of the *pecalang* as the village custom security apparatus clearly frightens Ms. IS. This can be seen as evidence of discrimination against the LGBT as the minority groups, this attitude is still prevalent. While in other parts of Denpasar, the migrant workers are no longer pay the KIPEMs, this depends on the customary regulation of each customary village.

By the beginning of October 2021, my key informant, Ms. TRS posted in her Facebook account, her expression of gratitude toward the Disdukcapil city of Denpasar and Badung regency. This expression of gratitude such as published by Ms. TRS Facebook is shown as an example on how discrimination takes place in an episodic manner but solved locally with no local based but gratitude. They have been living in Bali as transpuans for a long time in Bali, as for Ms. TRS she has been living in Bali for 15 years but no one cares, unless outside help come forward. At least this was the case until the “Suara Kita” LGBT NGO from Jakarta took the steps to connect to the Denpasar and Badung Dukcapil registration offices. Then Miss TRS gets her e-KTP by the beginning of October 2021.

*Suara Kita*, the NGO dealing with the LGBT, has three voluntary field workers in Bali, but the key informant of this paper was Ms. TRS, appointed as their leader by Suara Kita. She helps transpuans from Bali into processing their e-KTP. She knows 19 transpuans who don’t have any document, be it a family card (KK/Kartu Keluarga) or an old laminated KTP identity card. Several of them are Warcan or Pretty transpuan members. But she suspects that the real number of transpuans without paper is much bigger, around 100 people. She cannot reach all transpuans in Bali. She only focuses on the registration of the 19 transpuans without e-KTPs from Badung and Denpasar, and she expects to complete the job by the year 2022 and afterward. She would like to carry on and continue processing the transpuan’s e-KTP until mid-to-end of 2022 when the pandemic is diminished and those transpuans come over to gain this inclusive right as a citizen. However, by the end of 2022 as reported by Ms TRS that several transpuans have gone back to their villages outside Bali and some were those without e-KTP. She hopes when Covid-19 becoming endemic in 2023 and afterward, the case of transpuans work in Bali without e-KTP is miniscule and at best, no more transpuan without e-KTP.

Let us give a few examples. Ms. TRS explained what happened when she visited the Denpasar Disdukcapil office with another transpuan with no e-KTP. The clerk in charge was a male, and there was a police woman nearby. That male clerk was reluctant to help; witnessing this, the police woman offered to help. The male clerk started mocking the transpuan, suggesting she went back to Java to get the right documents. That police woman and our transpuans team were then advised by another Disdukcapil “female clerk” to go to the policewomen’s village head where the latter would make her a family card (*Kartu Keluarga*) or KK. This is what they did, eventually solving with this card the e-KTP problem of this particular transpuan. This example gives us an insight that male as cis man of clerical officer in Disdukcapil can be so rude and avoid any help toward a transpuan. Only when women (a woman police and another woman clerical of Disdukcapil who be friend with) took over the problem, then it was solved in good manners.

Another success story took place was in the premises of the Badung Disdukcapil office itself. The only document that had a Nusa Ceningan-Bali transpuan was an old laminated KTP, which was almost unreadable. Instead of refusing it, the Disdukcapil clerk in charge, a young lady, took the time needed to read it, albeit painstakingly, and after a couple of hours, she had completed the registration. When the transpuan saw her name appearing on the Kartu Keluarga screen next to her parent’s name, thus showing that she was now registered, she was overjoyed. This shows that Disdukcapil can indeed solve the transpuan’s e-KTP problem with the right person in charge. The old laminated KTP is usually

used as a bridge to identify a person and enable that person to get a real e-KTP from a KK with bar code as family card document. As the other main proof of identity is only the family card, or *Kartu Keluarga*, because it is NIK recorded in the center of Dirjen Dukcapil data base in Jakarta. The Disdukcapil is regency office available in every district, city and regency all over Indonesia. Otherwise, it is almost impossible to get an e-KTP, unless there is a “miracle”, as above with the police woman.

As digitalization is expanding exponentially under the spur of the pandemic, and as sanitary steps are been taken using this information technology, it becomes ever more important to solve the e-KTP issue for marginal groups such as transpuan. In the “Peduli Lindungi” platform, the entrance data, beside the registered mobile phone number, is also the NIK (*Nomor Induk Kependudukan* or National Registration Population Number) stated in every e-KTP. This is obtained through registration of the family head (*kepala keluarga*) card that is compulsory to have for each of household in Indonesia. In the future, the Dukcapil on line platform could be a primary source of data all over Indonesia. The KK, BPJS and Bank account platforms are already synchronized with one another and with the process can be done through the Disdukcapil on line under the name of Taring Dukcapil. Therefore, all citizens can gain access to the system and vice-versa. And it is ever expanding: an Akuwas platform is now being set up as a health database for Denpasar’s population, and also the taxation records should follow suit.

The transpuans want gender social justice. They want to be given the right to have a look (say a female) that does not correspond to their e-KTP registered gender (say male). It should not be an issue, if we take into account to face that gender fluidity has a long history behind it in Balinese dance and theater. Yet there is discrimination. It is now time to stop it by properly processing their e-KTP. The Disdukcapil officers especially men officers, should not mock transpuans or be reluctant to register them. No cis men or cis women should be allowed to shame or expel transpuan under any pretext, even religious basis. A professional approach should be expected of all Disdukcapil officials when processing papers. Referring to Connell (1995) this can be construed as an episode of exit politics. Episodic or not, gender justice has to be paramount. We should achieve inclusive treatment for marginal people.

When we consider Tilly’s three metaphors about the prospects of democratization (1995), we need skillful actors to protect marginal people from any injustice treatments. As everyone at this moment hold a mobile phone to get out of the check point by installing “*Peduli Lindungi*” application. This application platform is made available by the Ministry of Interior Affairs as government method to trace back the mobility of population during Corona pandemic in Indonesia. Beside personal data, this application could save the vaccination certificates as the collective action to prevent the Covid-19 infections and contaminations. It has also method to do scan the QR code at every public space that open for public and a method to trace and to let in who enter the properties. Therefore, transpuans are among those who can enter public area without any problem as long as the application is running well and she could pass the check point without problem.

The more this collective action is becoming popular, the expected outcome will create more open mindedness of people toward transgenders and they are becoming actors who appreciate human rights. The transpuans can have their face full of make up in their photo taken and posted in the necessary document that showing of their identity. They can freely walk down the street or in the malls, in the public and private properties with their personal attributes that are not heteronormative. As long as they hold a proper KTP which is electronic, then they must be inclusively treated as normal citizens, not as the marginal groups as formally include those mentally ill people nor the homeless or the bums. Unless they create problems openly and commit criminality. Social justice appreciates even mentally ill people, the homeless, the beggar, the bums and transgender. They have their own pride as human beings although they are minority among heteronormative majority of people.

## **6. Conclusion**

Gender theories (Buttler, 1990; Connell, 1995), can contribute to a search of solutions for the transpuan’s e-KTP issue in Bali. This issue is a little bit sensitive and therefore, this article aims at investigating social justice toward this minority group. Seen from the situation on the field, it appears clearly that the solutions are all non-local based and episodic, as well as an exit politics need to be implemented as suggested by Connell. It is the Suara Kita NGO from Jakarta that have incited Ms. TRS to seek recognition through the Badung and Denpasar Disdukcapil offices. In Singaraja the process went smoothly after Suara Kita got in touch with Mami SC in Singaraja, because Mami SC is a public figure and personally knows the regency head and the head of the Buleleng regency Disdukcapil. The exit politics advocated by Connell was played a major role in Warga community through Mami SC. However, taking into account what

Tilly proposes three metaphors to shape multigenderism, those minorities are LGBT, they hold human rights as others. Transpuans among them are thought to be a lake, then skillful engineers can build one in a valley with a river and plenty of space for the lake behind a dam, the skillful actors then build up the lake of multigenderism but not in a vast, flat desert, they build it in a proper manner and gratitude toward gender diversity. Although in some places, there are also times and places when a lake forms naturally, we need a skillful engineer to make transpuan rights to get their e-KTP available. In Denpasar and Badung, the south part of Bali, it was seemingly much more difficult, with the solution often being found through episodic personal assistance (usually women who help the transpuans).

The episode of male clericals at the public service who was reluctant to help, this is undoubtedly part of social injustice. In the public sphere, they are actors who supposedly do more professional service with all the standard operating procedure to implement inclusive treatments for all. Public space is neutral and people nowadays hold their mobile phones to show more regarding registration on one to other platforms that permit them entering public space freely (initially, it was e-HAC platform). Everyone has their mobile application chosen and further data collection are needed when talking about 'a must have mobile application'. Such as the "*Peduli-Lindungi*" is now one primary platform available during Covid-19 pandemic in Indonesia.

The more complete this available application, it is expected to be more user friendly and give more protections to each individual. Collective action needs to be encouraged by using "*Peduli Lindungi*" so as holding the e-KTP as the expected outcome will be that, the actors as social engineer would appreciate human rights. The transpuans can have their face full of make up with women outfit to be photographed and this picture could be posted in the necessary document that part of their identity although the gender is still a man. No public places could be prohibited for transpuans to freely walk and gather with their personal attributes that are non-heteronormative. However, to close the discussion, finally no discrimination should ever take place when transpuans need to get their data registration. They should have the possibility to register as male with a male name and gender as long as it is what is stated in their *Kartu Keluarga*, or by the court and each of them should then be given an e-KTP as national regulation. Besides that, if they want to have a female photograph of her own face on this card, this should be allowed. When gender justice is considered, no short-sighted moralistic judgment should be allowed to interfere.

## References

- Barton, G., Contesting Indonesia's Democratic Transition: Laskar Jihad, the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI) and Civil Society. In A. Vandenberg & N. Zuryani (Eds.), *Security, Democracy, and Society: Trouble with Protection*, pp. 305-332, 2020.
- Bhabha, H. K., *The Location of Culture*. Routledge, 1994.
- Blackwood, E., *Falling into the Lesbi World: Desire and Difference in Indonesia*. University of Hawai'i Press/ Project Muse. [muse.jhu.edu/book/845](http://muse.jhu.edu/book/845), 2010.
- Boellstorff, T., The emergence of political homophobia in Indonesia: masculinity and national belonging. *Ethnos*, 69, 4, 465-486, 2004.
- Boellstorff, T., *A Coincidence of Desires*. Duke University Press, 2007.
- Bourchier, D., *Illiberal Democracy in Indonesia, the ideology of the family state*. Routledge. Bourchier, D., *Two Decades of Ideological Contestation in Indonesia: From Democratic*, 2013.
- Cosmopolitanism to Religious Nationalism. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 49 (5), 713-733, 2019.
- Butler, J., *Gender Trouble, Feminism and the Subversion of Modernity*. Routledge. Butler, J., *Notes Towards a Performative Theory of Assembly*. Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Butler, J., The backlash against 'gender ideology' must stop. Gender theory is neither destructive nor indoctrinating; it simply seeks a form of political freedom. *The New Statesman*, 2019.
- Butler, J., *Gender in Translation: Beyond Monolingualism*. *Philosophia*, 9(1), 1-25, 2019b.
- Butler, J., Laclau, E., & Žižek, S. *Contingency, Hegemony, Universality: Contemporary Dialogues on the Left*. Verso, 2000.
- Connell, R., *Southern Theory, the global dynamics of knowledge in social science*, Polity. Connell, R., 2011.
- Confronting Equality, Gender, Knowledge and Global Change. Allen & Unwin. Connell, R. (2014). *Rethinking Gender from the South*. *Feminist Studies*, 40 (3), 518-539, 2007.
- Connell, R. W., *Ruling Class, Ruling Culture*. Cambridge University Press/ Cambridge Core. Connell, R. W., 1983.
- Which Way Is Up? *Essays On Class, Sex, And Culture*. George Allen & Unwin. Connell, R. W., *Gender and Power, Society, the Person and Sexual Politics*. Allen & Unwin, 1977.
- Connell, R. W., *Masculinities*. Allen & Unwin, 1995.

- Connell, R. W., & Irving, T. *Class Structure In Australian History*. Longman Cheshire, 1980.
- Hay, C., *Constructivist Institutionalism*. The Oxford Handbook of Political Institutionalism. S. A. Binder, R. A. W. Rhodes and B. A. Rockman. Oxford, Oxford University Press: 57-74, 2008.
- Hay, C., "Good in a crisis: the ontological institutionalism of social constructivism." *New Political Economy* 21(6): 52-535, 2016.
- Historia, *Majalah Sejarah Populer Pertama di Indonesia*, Takdir Waria di Persimpangan Jalan, No. 24, Tahun II, 2015
- Rodriguez, D. G. *The Muslim Waria of Yogyakarta, Finding Agency within Submission*. TSQ Transgender Studies Quarterly, 6 (3), 368-385, 2019.
- Sa'dan, M. *Santri Waria, Kisah Kehidupan Pondok Pesantren Waria Al-Fatah Yogyakarta*. DIVA Press, 2015.
- Said, E. *Orientalism*. Penguin, 1985.
- Tarrow, S., *Strangers at the Gates : Movements and States in Contentious Politics*. Cambridge University Press. <http://deakin.eblib.com.au/patron/FullRecord.aspx?p=880727>, 2012.
- Tidey, S., *Requiem for a Waria, Piety and the Political Potential of Ironic Experiences*. *Social Analysis*, 63 (1), 83-102, 2019.
- Tilly, C., *Democracy is a Lake. The Social Construction of Democracy, 1870-1990*. G. R. Andrews and H. Chapman. Basingstoke, Hampshire, Macmillan: 369-385, 1995.
- Tilly, C., *Social Movements, 1768-2004*. Boulder, London, Paradigm Publishers, 2004.
- Tilly, C., *Identities, Boundaries, and Social Ties*. Boulder, Colorado, Paradigm Publishers. Tilly, C, 2006, *Regimes and Repertoires*. Chicago, London, University of Chicago Press, 2005.
- Tilly, C., & Tarrow, S. *Contentious Politics*. Paradigm Publishers, 2006.
- Tilly, C., Tarrow, S., & McAdam, D. *To Map Contentious Politics*. *Mobilization*, 1(1), 17-34. *Tempo, Pesta Pora E-KTP*, 13-19, 2017.
- Toomiiistu, T., *Playground love: sex work, pleasure, and self-affirmation in the urban nightlife of Indonesian waria*. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 21 (2), 205-218, 20.
- Whitehead, L., *Democratization: Theory and Experience*. Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Zuryani, N. & Erviantono, T., *Gender Dualism as Degendering Cosmic Multicultural Tolerance of Warganegara: Community Security Practices in North Bali*. In A. Vandenberg & N. Zuryani (Eds.), *Security, Democracy, and Society: Trouble with Protection*, pp. 233-252, 2021.
- Zuryani, N. NP Yasintha, M Adityandana, NMAS mahadewi, NLN Kebayantini and G Kamajaya *Penguatan ODHA Transpuan Kota Denpasar dan Buleleng dalam Kesehatan Masyarakat Peduli Waria*, *Jurnal Ilmiah Widya SosioPolitika*, Vol 3, No. 2, 86-93 <https://ojs.unud.ac.id/index.php/widya/article/view/81447/42451>, 2021.

## **Biography**

**Nazrina Zuryani** is a senior lecturer at Sociology Department of Udayana University that work as a civil servant lecturer since 32 years ago in Bali. As a contributor of a book, she started her interest in gender studies as early as 1991 when the book of "Srikandi" published in Jakarta by PT Ciptawidya Iswara in a hard cover depicting 158 high women achievers in Indonesia. Despite other books that she contributed during 1984-1988 publications (around 6 books altogether) by Kelompok Studi Proklamasi, Jakarta. Her latest book (2021) was a co-editor with Andrew Vandenberg in a book entitled "Security, Democracy, and Society in Bali; Trouble with protection" published by Palgrave, Macmillan; Singapore. In this book, despite her solo chapter #6, she also wrote with Tedi Erviantono in chapter #10 on "Gender Dualism as Degendering Cosmic Multicultural Tolerance of Warganegara: Community Security Practices in North Bali". Along with her Master Degree in Demography (from the ANU) and also her PhD topic (from Newcastle University-Australia), that are related to gender order in public and domestic sphere. She argues that empowerment is a jargon slogan from government apparatus and agency stakeholders. When the women voices were recorded, a minuscule of empowerment taking place and no real social justice happens. Women are the doer and men are the decision maker. Her interest is more to gender equal justice. Although lately, Youtube shows on her subject of Culinary Sociology #1, #2, #3 up to #6 as part of the media teaching of MBKM in Udayana University, Bali. As well some students from Faculty Economic and Business Udayana University made Youtube production available for Political Sociology subject with hashtag FEB# and another subject on Social Planning/Perencanaan Sosial.